ICLEI Africa Secretariat and Cities Biodiversity Center Review of

Towards a National Urban Development Plan: An Urbanisation Roadmap for Tanzania

drafted by the Coalition for Urban Transitions

Comments provided on: 21 February 2019

Comments from Kirsty Griffin (Climate perspective)

My main overarching comment is that whilst climate change mitigation features quite prominently in the roadmap (with some good and innovative ideas), climate change adaptation is not mentioned at all. On a similar vein, nature and nature-based solutions barely features (referred to as environment through, so quite broad).

So my main comment is that the document could be really strengthened by adding in both climate change adaptation aspects (specifically where recommendations for large scale infrastructure development is proposed); as well as nature-based solutions aspects.

Then areas where I think specifically climate change could be brought in are listed below:

- pg. 8 Paragraph 2 notes that climate change has the potential to have a significant impact on citizens living in Tanzania. It highlights that Tanzania is responding proactively and has submitted an NDC and is also investing in mitigation-related development. However there is no mention of adaptation actions. What is Tanzania doing right now to increase their resilience to the impacts of climate change they will already experience? Do they have a Climate Change Adaptation Action Plan? This needs to come out more strongly here.. especially as one of the purposes of the report is to "reduce the risks of climate change".

- pg. 9 Paragraph 5 notes that if the development of a NUDP is successful that Tanzania would be able to save a significant portion of GHG emissions. Again there is no reference to climate change adaptation (which is closely linked to mitigation) or how climate change adaptation can benefit cities in the long-run?

- pg. 33 climate goals need to be both linked to mitigation and adaptation. At this stage, only mitigation is mentioned. Cities need to be developing in such a way so that they not only take into account the GHG emission advantages of investing in certain infrastructure but also take into account future climate risks, the associated anticipated climate impacts on a city and invest in the infrastructure well in advance that can withstand anticipated impacts to increase the resilience of citizens.

- pg. 38 The top paragraph notes that catalytic mega-infrastructure projects are most effective when combined with environmental protection projects. There is reference to mitigation projects but again no adaptation related projects are mentioned. It is important to make the link between climate adaptation and climate and large-scale infrastructure so feel that this need to come out more clearly here. Table 5 on pg 39 should include some climate change adaptation project examples.

Comments from Ernita van Wyk (Nature-based Solutions and Biodiversity Perspective)

Urban nature is absolutely essential to urban growth and development. The food produced, the quality of the air breathed, the temperatures experienced, the opportunities for tourism - these create opportunities for improved livelihoods, jobs, health and climate change risk reduction. Even though many of Tanzania's cities are growing very fast, many of these cities still have natural assets which, if protected and enhanced, and even retro-fitted, can support human wellbeing and economic growth and development.

Here are a few points which could help to integrate the benefits of urban nature into the Tanzanian Urbanization Roadmap:

- From the Introduction: "Macroeconomic growth has remained strong and, since 2008, revenue collection has improved in every year except 2015. This has enabled new investment in much-needed infrastructure (NBS 2018)." Here is an opportunity to incorporate investment in green infrastructure. Many cities around the world are incorporating green and a combination of green-grey infrastructure into their planning due to the multiple benefits (financial and other) and co-benefits that can be gained (Kabisch et al., 2017; Griscom et al., 2017; Braubach et al., 2017; Depietri and McPhearson, 2017). For example, in Tanzania, Dar es Salaam is starting to think in this direction with their Thematic Atlas and Greening Strategy which links greening with the provision of ecosystem services (Karutz et al., 2018), to prioritise areas where enhanced city greening can alleviate issues such as urban heat and air pollution (many of these issues are related to Climate Change). The Presidential Campaign 'Make Dodoma Green', as well as many other green initiatives in cities and municipalities such as Arusha and Moshi indicate the commitment and desire by cities and sub-national governments to benefit from urban nature. (Also see refs: White et al, 2017 and Culwick et al., 2016). Nature-based solutions are not panaceas but they are gaining in popularity and they can be combined with or

assessed for their benefits and costs and weighed against other types of solutions for cities to consider (Nesshöver et al., 2017).

- Sub-national authorities in Tanzania need a greater body of evidence to support the awareness of the contribution nature-based solutions to urban problems for e.g. through carbon sinks, pollution reduction and cooling. More evidence is needed to show how nature-based solutions in cities contribute directly to Climate targets such as NDCs, and how this influences and improves public health in cities (see TNC TreesforHealth report), financial savings and improved wellbeing of urban citizens (see Kabisch book, part II). Case studies and evidence is especially needed from African contexts. National policies need to support and urge donors and research orgs and parastatals to generate this evidence locally, in African and Tanzanian context. This means that cities should be supported in implementing and trialling nature-based solutions and tracking their impact.

- I would like to highlight urban nature's contribution and potentially enhanced contribution to tourism and the associated economic opportunities. Globally, travellers visit cities for their cultural and natural treasures or even just enjoy the city for its amenities, good food, entertainment and beautiful surrounds, including greenery. Tanzania is already a tourism-rich country but with massive urban growth looming, enhanced urban nature (wild and artificial) can provide improved income and wellbeing opportunities from tourism, as people transit through Tanzanian cities or visit them for their natural and cultural assets. (See Global report on City Tourism). Policies are needed for maximising the economic and ecological benefits of nature tourism in cities (See the Table Mountain National Park report, 2004, for its significant contribution to the local and national economy).

- One aspect of nature tourism is Tanzania's biodiversity (See box below). The benefits of biodiversity-based tourism in Tanzania are already felt but the benefits can be much enhanced and cities have an important role to play as many cities in Tanzania are located within or near key national and global biodiversity assets. National government, whilst already promoting tourism, can do more to promote, globally, the unique natural assets of Tanzania and to demonstrate how the government is actively supporting the protection, sustainable use and enjoyment of this global treasure. National government can also facilitate greater support for the research and knowledge base (e.g. through COSTECH and advising and directing research and donor projects) and the maintenance of the biodiversity data inventories (e.g. TANBIF) that form the backbone of evidence-based decision-making for conservation and sustainable use of natural resources. Greater support from national government in this regard will unlock increased global interest and investment in Tanzania's biodiversity-based tourism.

From INTERACT-Bio (https://cbc.iclei.org/project/interact-bio/)

In their seminal paper of 2000, Myers and colleagues identified 25 globally important biodiversity hotspots. A 'hotspot' refers to areas of exceptional concentrations of endemic species that are undergoing exceptional loss of habitat. The purpose of identifying the hotspots was to guide prioritisation of conservation investments. The Eastern Arc and Coastal Forests of Tanzania and Kenya constitutes one of the 25 globally critical biodiversity hotspots. This hotspot occurs along the Tanzanian and Kenyan coasts from the border with Somalia to the north, to the border with Mozambique to the south. It straddles two ecoregions: Eastern Arc Forest and Northern Zanzibar-Inhambane Coastal Forest Mosaic. Of the original 30 000 km^2, 2 000 km^2 (6.7%) of the hotspot still remains. The levels of protection of this hotspot remnant are strongly dependent on local factors, such as proximity to urban areas, pressure for land (especially for agriculture), pollution, the presence of valuable timber and the capacity of law enforcement officers.

- Tanzania, as signatory to the Convention on Biological Diversity, has a very good National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan (NBSAP) (and associated National Environmental Action Plan - NEAP) as well as a growing interest in developing Local Biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans (e.g. Ilala) but these are typically not integrated with PORALG efforts or planning by the Ministry of Lands, or Tourism. Attention to the natural environment and its benefits for cities is already reflected in many city and Municipal Strategic Plans. In other words, the intention is there and cities and subnational governments make some progress with limited budget but could do with greater support via a NUDP and national facilitation that creates more alignment and support between the relevant Ministries and at the city level, in support of the enhancement and sustainable use of natural assets but also greater support in mainstreaming nature into city development and spatial planning (IIED, 2017; Warmsler et al, 2017; Cowling et al, 2008; Manuel et al., 2016).

- With the NUDP in anticipation there is an opportunity for the central government to facilitate greater city-government and city-sectoral integration so that these sectors and local governments can define their contributions and respective benefits to be gained from urban nature and in particular, the impacts of urban nature on a city's capacity to engage climate change mitigation and adaptation.

- There is increasing investor interest, globally, in securing and maintaining the flow of urban ecosystem services and an urban roadmap may benefit from reference to these opportunities. This aligns well with the notion of blended finance as per p. 35.

- On p. 31 Cities are complex social, environmental, cultural, technical and economic systems, much more than the sum of their sectors or their investments (i.e. I would add 'environmental').